

Jayachandran E.V. vs State of Kerala

Jayachandran E.V. vs State of Kerala

SooperKanoon Citation : sooperkanoon.com/1690356

Court : Kerala Orders

Decided On : Apr-08-2021

Judge : Honourable Mrs. Justice Anu Sivaraman

Appeal No. : WP(C)/23079/2020

Appellant : Jayachandran E.V.

Respondent : State of Kerala

Judgement :

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN
THURSDAY, THE 08TH DAY OF APRIL 2021 / 18TH CHAITHRA, 1943
WP(C).No.22615 OF 2020(B) PETITIONERS: 1 MOHAMED HARIS U.M
AGED 48 YEARS WATCHMAN(HIGHER GRADE), KERALA WATER
AUTHORITY, P.H.SECTION, GURUVAYUR, THRISSUR DISTRICT. 2
JIJU T.J., WATCHMAN (HIGHER GRADE), KERALA WATER
AUTHORITY, P.H.SECTION, GURUVAYUR, THRISSUR DISTRICT. 3
M.R.VIJAYAKUMAR, WATCHMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,
P.H.SECTION, THRITHALA, PALAKKAD DISTRICT. 4 PRAKASAN.K,
WATCHMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H.CIRCLE,
THRISSUR. 5 CHANDRAN P.P., WATCHMAN (HIGHER GRADE),

KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H.SECTION, CHELAKKARA, THRISSUR DISTRICT. 6 JOSHI C.O., P.H.SUB DIVISION, GURUVAYUR, THRISSUR DISTRICT. 7 SAMUEL.E.D., P.H.DIVISION, THRISSUR. 8 NISHA T., P.H.SUB DIVISION, GURUVAYUR, THRISSUR DISTRICT. BY ADVS. DR.K.P.SATHEESAN (SR.) SRI.P.MOHANDAS (ERNAKULAM) SRI.K.SUDHINKUMAR SRI.S.K.ADHITHYAN SRI.SABU PULLAN SRI.GOKUL D. SUDHAKARAN RESPONDENTS: 1 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY, WATER RESOURCES DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695001.

2 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, JALA BHAVAN, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033. R2 BY ADV. SMT.MARY BENJEMIN OTHER PRESENT: MARY BENJEMIN, SC THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 19-03-2021, ALONG WITH WP(C).23079/2020(H), WP(C).23687/2020(I), WP(C).26378/2020(V), WP(C).1626/2021(C), THE COURT ON 08-04-2021 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN THURSDAY, THE 08TH DAY OF APRIL 2021 / 18TH CHAITHRA, 1943 WP(C).No.23079 OF 2020(H) PETITIONERS: 1 JAYACHANDRAN E.V. AGED 54 YEARS PROJECT DIVISION, KANNUR. 2 RAJEESH P.K, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, PERALASSERY, KANNUR. 3 GANESHAN T, OFFICE ATTENDANT , KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY DIVISION, THALIPARAMBA, KANNUR.

4 PREETHA P, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, PAYYANNUR, KANNUR 5 SREEJITH K.K, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY DIVISION, KANNUR-12. 6 RAHIYANATH C, OFFICE ATTENDANT , KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY DIVISION, KANNUR-12. 7 ANITHA K, CIRCLE,

KANNUR. 8 ATHIRA G, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, KANNUR. 9 MAGESH N, PROJECT DIVISION, KANNUR. 10 SUSAMMA THOMAS, PUBLIC HEALTH SECTION, CHANGANACHERRY, KOTTAYAM DISTRICT. 11 SAJIN KURIAKOSE, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER WORKS SECTION NO.1, KOTTAYAM. 12 JAYASREE P.R, PUBLIC HEALTH DIVISION, KOTTAYAM. 13 T.A. KURIAN, PUBLIC HEALTH DIVISION, KOTTAYAM. 14 MADHU P.S, PROJECT DIVISION, KOTTAYAM. 15 ROBIN SELVARAJ CIRCLE, KOZHIKODE. 16 DHARMAJITH D, DIVISION, KOZHIKODE. 17 RATHEESH K.P. OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER, KOZHIKODE. 18 SINDHU A.C, OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER, KOZHIKODE. 19 DEEPA C.K, DISTRIBUTION SUB DIVISION NO.1, KOZHIKODE. 20 ANIL KUMAR C, OFFICE ATTENDANT , KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H. DIVISION, KOLLAM. 21 SIBIN RAJ R, JNNURM PROJECT CIRCLE, KOCHI-682 011 22 DILNA GHOSH K.A, JNNURM PROJECT CIRCLE, KOCHI-682 011 23 ARUN CHANDRAN B, DIVISION, MUVATTUPUZHA, ERNAKULAM. 24 NISAMUDHEEN K.M, DIVISION, MUVATTUPUZHA, ERNAKULAM. 25 NABEEL BABU K, CIRCLE, MALAPPURAM. 26 SALI ERAYATHAN, PROJECT DIVISION, MALAPPURAM. 27 BEENA K.K., SECTION, NILAMBUR, MALAPPURAM. 28 ARSHAD P.N, SECTION, MANJERI, MALAPPURAM. 29 VIJAYAN T, SUB DIVISION, PARAPPANANGADY, MALAPPURAM. 30 AYYOB C.P, OFFICE ATTENDANT , KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H. DIVISION, MALAPPURAM. 31 NAFEESA P.A, PROJECT DIVISION, MALAPPURAM. 32 BALRAJ V, SUB DIVISION, MANJERI, MALAPPURAM. 33 RENUKA V, SUB DIVISION, PONNANI, MALAPPURAM. 34 ANANDAN S, DIVISION, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM. 35 JAMEELA K, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, HEAD WORKS SECTION, KOZHIKODE. 36 PINKY V. NAIR, SECTION, OACHIRA, KOLLAM. 37 REJITHA T, SUB DIVISION, KOLLAM. 38 SUNITHA K.V, CIRCLE, PALAKKAD. 39 K.HANEEFA, SECTION, MANANTHAVADY, WAYANAD. 40 NASSER K.K. CIRCLE, MUVATTUPUZHA, ERNAKULAM.

41 JIJI KUMAR K.S, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY DIVISION, ERNAKULAM, KOCHI-682 018 42 WILSON E, SUB DIVISION, KOTTARAKARA, KOLLAM. 43 JAYAKUMAR V.R, OFFICE

ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, KOLLAM.

44 SOBHA M.B, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, PUTHENCROUZ, ERNAKULAM. 45 P.A. NAZAR, SUB DIVISION, SULTHANBATHERY, WAYANAD. 46 PRINCE KUMAR J, OFFICE ATTENDANT J, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, KOLLAM. 47 R. ANILKUMAR, DIVISION, KADUTHURUTHY, KOTTAYAM. 48 SHIJI KUMAR, OFFICE ATTENDANT, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY DIVISION, KALAMASSERY, ERNAKULAM.

49 DEVI N, LASCAR, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, THALASSERY, KANNUR. 50 SREEKUMAR K.K, LINEMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H. SECTION, THRIKKAKKARA, ERNAKULAM. 51 GEORGE A.V, WATCHMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H. HEAD WORKS SECTION, ALUVA, ERNAKULAM. 52 SREEJITH, WATCHMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, KOLLAM. 53 VINEESH V, WATCHMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H. SECTION, CHATHANNOOR, KOLLAM. 54 SAJEEV K.V, WATCHMAN, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, I.W.A. SECTION, PUTHENCROUZ, ERNAKULAM.

BY ADVS. DR.K.P.SATHEESAN (SR.) SRI.P.MOHANDAS (ERNAKULAM) SRI.K.SUDHINKUMAR SRI.S.K.ADHITHYAN SRI.SABU PULLAN SRI.GOKUL D. SUDHAKARAN RESPONDENTS: 1 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY, WATER RESOURCES DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 001 2 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, JALA BHAVAN, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033 R2 BY ADV. SMT.MARY BENJEMIN THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 19-03-2021, ALONG WITH WP(C).22615/2020(B), WP(C).23687/2020(I), WP(C).26378/2020(V), WP(C).1626/2021(C), THE COURT ON 08-04-2021 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN THURSDAY, THE 08TH DAY OF APRIL 2021 / 18TH CHAITHRA, 1943 WP(C).No.23687 OF 2020(I) PETITIONER:

N.K SANTHOSH, AGED 49 YEARS LINEMAN (UNDER ORDER OF TRANSFER), W W SECTION NO.1, KWA SUB - DIVISION, VYTTILA, ERNAKULAM - 682020. BY ADVS. SRI.PHILIP T.VARGHESE SRI.THOMAS T.VARGHESE SMT.ACHU SUBHA ABRAHAM SMT.K.R.MONISHA SMT.V.T.LITHA SMT.SHRUTHI SARA JACOB RESPONDENTS: 1 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY, WATER RESOURCE DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM - 695001.

2 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, JALA BHAVAN, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM - 695003, 3 THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER PH DIVISION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, ERNAKULAM - 682016

4 THE ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE ENGINEER WATER WORKS SUB DIVISION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, VYTTILA, ERNAKULAM - 682020. R2-4 BY ADV. SMT.MARY BENJEMIN THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 19-03-2021, ALONG WITH WP(C).22615/2020(B), WP(C).23079/2020(H), WP(C).26378/2020(V), WP(C).1626/2021(C), THE COURT ON 08-04-2021 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN THURSDAY, THE 08TH DAY OF APRIL 2021 / 18TH CHAITHRA, 1943 WP(C).No.26378 OF 2020(V) PETITIONER: PRAMOD KUMAR T.V AGED 47 YEARS S/O LATE SREEDHARAN A V, AVIKKARA HOUSE, KANHANGAD P O, KASARGOD, PIN-671315. BY ADV. SRI.PRAMOJ ABRAHAM RESPONDENTS: 1 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY, WATER RESOURCES

DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695001. 2 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, JALABHAVAN, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN-695033. R2 BY ADV. SMT.MARY BENJEMIN THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 19-03-2021, ALONG WITH WP(C).22615/2020(B), WP(C).23079/2020(H), WP(C).23687/2020(I), WP(C).1626/2021(C), THE COURT ON 08-04-2021 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MRS. JUSTICE ANU SIVARAMAN THURSDAY, THE 08TH DAY OF APRIL 2021 / 18TH CHAITHRA, 1943 WP(C).No.1626 OF 2021(C) PETITIONERS: 1 MANU.R AGED 46 YEARS WATCHMAN,WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,SASTHAMCOTTA, KOLLAM DISTRICT.

2 RAJEEV KUMAR.G, WATCHMAN,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H.SECTION,MAVELIKKARA,ALAPPUZHA DISTRICT. 3 HARIKUMAR.M, WATCHMAN,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, P.H.SECTION,MAVELIKKARA,ALAPPUZHA DISTRICT. 4 GOPAKUMAR.S, WATCHMAN,KERALA WATER AUTHORITYK P.H.SECTION,MAVELIKKARA,ALAPPUZHA DISTRICT. 5 BINDHU.B, OFFICE ATTENDANT,WATER SUPPLY SECTION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,PUNALUR,KOLLAM DISTRICT. 6 SUKIN.K, WATCHMAN,WATER SUPPLY SECTION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,KEEZHALOOR, KANNUR DISTRICT. 7 RESHMA.V, OFFICE ATTENDANT,P.H.SECTION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,NENMARA,PALAKKAD DISTRICT. 8 SARANYA.S, OFFICE ATTENDANT,WATER SUPPLY SECTION-1, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,KOLLAM. 9 DEEPTHI.R, OFFICE ATTENDANT,P.H.SECTION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,VALAKAM,KOLLAM DISTRICT. 10 SURUCHI.V.B, OFFICE ATTENDANT,P.H.SECTION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,VALAKAM,KOLLAM DISTRICT.

11 SHEMEENA BEEVI.A, OFFICE ATTENDANT,P.H.SECTION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,CHATHANNOOR,KOLLAM DISTRICT. 12 C.GIREESAN, OFFICE ATTENDANT,WATER SECTION NO.3, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,KANNUR. 13 BINDHU.P, OFFICE ATTENDANT,WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,ATTINGAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM DISTRICT.

14 BINEESH JOHN, WATCHMAN,P.H.SUB DIVISION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,THODUPUZHA,IDUKKI DISTRICT. 15 BABU P.THOMAS, WATCHMAN,P.H.DIVISION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITYTHODUPUZHA,IDUKKI DISTRICT. 16 AJIKUMAR.N.K, WATCHMAN,P.H.DIVISION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITYTHODUPUZHA,IDUKKI DISTRICT. 17 SINDHU.C, OFFICE ATTENDANT,P.H.DIVISION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,AREEKODE,MALAPPURAM DISTRICT. 18 ABBAS BEPUKARAN, WATCHMAN,P.H.SECTION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,AREEKODE,MALAPPURAM DISTRICT.

19 SUNIKUTTAN.M.K, WATCHMAN,IWS MAINTENANCE SECTION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,CHOONDY, ERNAKULAM DISTRICT. 20 NAVAS.K.S, WATCHMAN,IWS MAINTENANCE SECTION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,CHOONDY, ERNAKULAM DISTRICT. 21 SANTHOSH.N.K, WATCHMAN,IWS MAINTENANCE SECTION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,CHOONDY,ERNAKULAM DISTRICT. 22 HIJA.G, OFFICE ATTENDANT,WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION,KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, ATTINGAL,THIRUVANANTHAPURAM.

23 VINOD.S, OFFICE ATTENDANT,WATER SUPPLY SECTION NO.1,UNDER WATER SUPPLY SUB DIVISION, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY,ATTINGAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM. BY ADVS. DR.K.P.SATHEESAN (SR.) SRI.P.MOHANDAS (ERNAKULAM) SRI.K.SUDHINKUMAR SRI.S.K.ADHITHYAN SRI.SABU PULLAN SRI.GOKUL D. SUDHAKARAN RESPONDENTS: 1 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY THE SECRETARY, WATER RESOURCES DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT SECRETARAIT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695001. 2 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY, JALA

BHAVAN, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033. R2 BY ADV. SMT. MARY BENJEMIN THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 19-03-2021, ALONG WITH WP(C).22615/2020(B), WP(C).23079/2020(H), WP(C).23687/2020(I), WP(C).26378/2020(V), THE COURT ON 08-04-2021 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

JUDGMENT

[WP(C).22615/2020, WP(C).23079/2020, WP(C).23687/2020, WP(C).26378/2020 & WP(C).1626/2021] Dated this the 8th day of April 2021

1. Petitioners are last grade servants under the Kerala Water

Authority. They challenge the orders issued by the respondents requiring them to function as meter readers in various offices in the authority. They contend that the method of appointment of meter readers is governed by the Kerala Public Health Engineering Subordinate Service Special Rules and the appointment is by direct recruitment and by transfer from among peons, lascars, watchers, cleaners or turn-cocks employed in the Department in the ratio of 1:1. It is submitted that some of the petitioners are fully eligible for appointment as meter readers by transfer. However, without granting them any such appointment by transfer, the respondents are taking steps to transfer the petitioner out and also requiring them to work as meter readers. It is submitted that only a negligible amount is paid as compensation for the additional duties which have to be undertaken by them. It is submitted that in the guise of re-structuring of the staff pattern, the petitioners are transferred out to distant places without considering the extreme hardship that they have to suffer and are also being required to work as meter readers though their substantive appointments as last grade servants is sustained. It is submitted that the entire exercise is completely vitiated by extraneous considerations and that only a few persons are meted out with this differential treatment, while the majority of last grade servants are permitted to work in their respective offices and that the exercise is undertaken on completely political considerations.

2. A detailed counter affidavit and an additional counter affidavit

have been placed on record by the 2 nd respondent. It is submitted that the present arrangement by which re- arrangement of the staff has been effected in administrative exigencies is only a temporary arrangement and will not result in loss of any promotional avenues to the petitioners. It is submitted that the petitioners will be eligible for an amount of Rs.300/- as additional allowance for meter reading and that they will not be forced to carry on any duties which they do not wish to perform. It is submitted that it is only due to the financial stringency faced by the respondent authority and to face the situation by accepting financial control measures which have become necessary due to the Covid outbreak and the resultant lock-down that the orders have been issued. It is stated in the additional counter affidavit that only those last grade employees, who are rendered redundant in their offices have been moved out and there is no political consideration in the above orders.

3. It is stated in paragraph 4 of the additional counter affidavit as follows:-

4.The criteria adopted for issuing Exhibit P1 order is that the senior most office attendants, line man, watchers, lascars in each unit was transferred out. For eg. 1st Petitioner number in Writ Petition. No. 23079 of 2020 is one Mr. Jayachandran E.V. He is serial number 232 in Exhibit PI. The last column (column 6) of Exhibit PI is date of joining the present office. The date of joining of Mr. Jayachandran E.V in the present station from where he is now transferred out is 16.11.2006. He is the senior most office attendant in Project Division, Kannur.

4. The details of the petitioners are also given in the additional

counter affidavit. It is stated that steps are only a part of the financial stringency measures adopted by the authority and that the allegations of mala fides are completely unfounded. It is specifically stated by the learned standing counsel that none of the petitioners have been transferred out of their districts and any transfer out of the district is based on request of the incumbents.

5. I have considered the contentions advanced. Taking note of

the specific contentions raised in the counter affidavit and the additional counter affidavit filed, I am of the opinion that the prayers sought for in the writ petition cannot be granted. However, if the petitioners have any individual grievance with regard to their postings, they will be free to raise the same before the competent authority in the respondents. If such individual grievances are raised, they will be considered within three weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this

judgment along with a copy of the representation. It is made

clear that those of the petitioners who are willing to carry out the meter reading activities on acceptance of the enhanced remuneration will be permitted to do so. The present arrangement shall be purely temporary and shall, by no means, affect the rights of the petitioners, including their right to be considered for by transfer appointment in Class III posts in their turn and according to their seniority. The writ petitions are ordered accordingly. sd/- Anu Sivaraman, Judge sj APPENDIX OF WP(C) 22615/2020 PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER

NO.KWA/JB/E3/7839/2015 DATED 22.02.2019 ISSUED BY THE DEPUTY CHIEF ENGINEER, KERALA WATER AUTHORITY ACCEPTING THE RELINQUISHMENT MADE BY THE 1ST PETITIONER. EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

ORDER NO.12521/JS1(EST)/2020/KWA DATED

16.10.2020. EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER DATED 13.12.2017 IN W.P.(C)NO.24669/2017. APPENDIX OF WP(C) 23079/2020 PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS: EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER NO. 12521/JS1 (EST)/2020/KWA DATED 16.10.2020 ISSUED BY THE 2ND RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER DATED 13.12.2017 IN W.P.C NO. 24669/2017 EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CIRCULAR NO. 13556/JS1 (EST)/2020/KWA DATED 23.10.2020 ISSUED BY THE 2ND RESPONDENT. APPENDIX OF WP(C) 23687/2020 PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS: EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF ORDER NO.E1/872/2013 ISSUED BY THE 3RD RESPONDENT

DATED 06.07.2017. EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF RELEVANT PAGES (1,2,3,25)
OF

ORDER ON 12521/JS1(EST)/2020/KWA ISSUED BY

THE 2ND RESPONDENT DATED 16.10.2020. EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE
REPRESENTATION SUBMITTED BY THE PETITIONER TO THE 2ND
RESPONDENT DATED 21.10.2020.

EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER

NO.KWA/AEE/VTC/E12/14 ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT DATED
23.10.2020. EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF ORDER NO.KWA/AEE/VTC/E12/2014
ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT DATED 28.10.2020. APPENDIX OF WP(C)
26378/2020 PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS: EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE
ORDER DATED 16.10.2020 ISSUED BY THE 2ND RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P2
TRUE COPY OF THE CIRCULAR DATED 23.10.2020 ISSUED BY THE 2ND
RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER DATED 28/10/2020
IN WPC NO.23079/2020. APPENDIX OF WP(C) 1626/2021 PETITIONER'S
EXHIBITS:

EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER

KNO.12521/JS1(EST)/2020/KWA DATED 16.10.2020 ISSUED BY THE 2ND
RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER DATED 13-12-2017
IN W.P.(C)NO.24669/2017 EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CIRCULAR
NNO.13556/JS1(EST)/2020/KWA DATED 23-10- 2020 ISSUED BY THE 2ND
RESPONDENT EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER DATED 28-10-2020
IN W.P(C)NO.23079/2020. True copy PS to Judge

SooperKanoon - India's Premier Online Legal Search - sooperkanoon.com