

Nandini K vs the Union of India

Nandini K vs the Union of India

SooperKanoon Citation : sooperkanoon.com/1506360

Court : Kerala

Decided On : Dec-19-2022

Judge : Honourable Mr.Justice V.G.Arun

Appeal No. : WP(C)/24058/2022

Appellant : Nandini K

Respondent : The Union of India

Judgement :

CR

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY,
THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C)
NO. 24058 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 NANDINI K AGED 54 YEARS
WIFE OF A M MOHAN KUMAR, 'ASHIRWAD', VELLINEZHI,
PALAKKAD, PIN - 679504 2 A.M. MOHAN KUMAR AGED 57 YEARS
SON OF O SANKARAN NAIR, 'ASHIRWAD', VELLINEZHI, PALAKKAD,
PIN - 679504 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI A.MEGHA NAYANPALLY
RAMOLA(MAH/6224/2014), AMICUS CURIE RESPONDENT/S:

1 THE UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI , PIN - 110001 2 THE DIRECTOR MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI (ADDRESS OF R2 IS CORRECTED AS THE CHAIRMAN, NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION,POCKET-14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE-I, NEW DELHI-110 077 AS PER THE ORDER DATED 29- 07-2022 IN IA NO.1/2022 IN WP(C) NO.24058/2022.), PIN - 110077 3 THE STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM , PIN - 695001 4 THE DIRECTOR

-2-

KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM (ADDRESS OF R4 IS CORRECTED AS THE REGISTRAR, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANANTHAPURAM-695 035. AS PER THE ORDER DATED 29-07-2022 IN IA NO.1/2022 IN WP(C) NO.24058/2022, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADVS. MALINI K. MENON, CGC

SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON

19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -3-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY,
THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C)
NO. 24508 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 K. SNEHALATHA AGED 57
YEARS WIFE OF GOPALAKRISHNAN, 'VADAKKUMMURY HOUSE',
CHOROTTUR ROAD, MANISSERI PO, VANIYAMKULAM - II,
PALAKKAD, PIN - 679521 2 V. GOPALAKRISHNAN AGED 64 YEARS
SON OF O SANKARAN NAIR, 'VADAKKUMMURY HOUSE',
CHOROTTUR ROAD, MANISSERI PO, VANIYAMKULAM - II,
PALAKKAD, PIN - 679521 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA
REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND
FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2
THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14,
SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE
OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF
HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, -4-

SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 THE
REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN
MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035
5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH (RCH) OFFICER
DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE
DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING
DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADVS.
JAGADEESH LAKSHMAN CGC SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA
STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C). 25078/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -5-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 25078 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 REEMA V AGED 39 YEARS WIFE OF SURENDRAN NAIR, 'KANNAMPLETH', THAZHAVA S W, THAZHAVA PO, KARUNAGAPPALLY, KOLLAM., PIN - 2 SURENDRAN NAIR V.K AGED 61 YEARS SON OF KARTHYAYANI AMMA, 'VILAVITH HOUSE', NEAR VILAVITH BHAGAVATHI TEMPLE,, VATTAKKATTUPADY, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 683542 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, -6-

SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 THE REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE,COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER, DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673

BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ, SC CGC V.GIRISHKUMAR OTHER PRESENT:
AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL
DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY
HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND
CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE
FOLLOWING: -7-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY,
THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C)
NO. 26011 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 P. SHEEBA PAUL AGED 51
YEARS W/O.SIMON ANTHONY, ELEVATHINGAL, KONNU ROAD,
ANGAMALY P.O., ERNAKULAM., PIN - 683572 2 SIMON E.A AGED 58
YEARS ELEVATHINGAL, KONNU ROAD, ANGAMALY P.O.,
ERNAKULAM., PIN - 683572 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S
V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S:

1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY
OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW
DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL
COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW
DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS
SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE,
SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 THE
REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN

-8- MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD,
NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035
5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH")
OFFICER, DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE,
MARINE DRIVE,ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 6 THE MANAGING
DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD,
PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV

N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022, 25078/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -9-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 26035 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 USHA ANITHA ABRAHAM AGED 51 YEARS WIFE OF RENU THOMAS, 'THAYIL PUTHENVEEDU', THUMPAMON PO, PANDALAM, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689572 2 RENU THOMAS AGED 51 YEARS SON OF P T THOMAS, 'THAYIL PUTHENVEEDU', THUMPAMON PO, PANDALAM, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689572 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE DEPARTMENT, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 THE REGISTRAR -10-

KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER,MDISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA , PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA. , PIN -

686673 BY ADVS. VISHNU RAJAGOPAL N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC VISHNU RAJAGOPAL THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -11-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 26066 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 KOCHURANI MATHEW AGED 51 YEARS WIFE OF ROY JOSEPH, THEKKEL, KOZHUVANAL P O, PULIYANNOOR, KOTTAYAM. , PIN - 686573 2 ROY JOSEPH AGED 54 YEARS HUSBAND OF KOCHURANI MATHEW, THEKKEL, KOZHUVANAL P O, MEENACHIL, KOTTAYAM , PIN - 686573 BY ADVS. AKASH S. V.S.VARALEKSHMI GIRISH KUMAR M S RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, -12-

SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 THE REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE,COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER, DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH

CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673 BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C). 25078/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -13-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 26559 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SHYMA AGED 50 YEARS WIFE OF UMESH KUMAR, 'KUNNATH HOUSE', PULINTHANAM, ENANALLOOR, NORTH BEYPORE, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673015 2 UMESH KUMAR AGED 56 YEARS SON OF INDRANI, 'MADHAVAM', KUNNOTH, KAKKOTI, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673611 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE DEPARTMENT, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 -14-

4 THE REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH

CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADVS. VISHNU JAYAPALAN N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC VISHNU J THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -15-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 26563 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 GRACY BENNY AGED 56 YEARS WIFE OF BENNY MATHAI, 'PALLITHAZHATHU', PULINTHANAM, ENANALLOOR, KOTHAMANGALAM, ERNAKULAM , PIN - 686671 2 BENNY MATHAI AGED 57 YEARS SON OF MATHAI, 'PALLITHAZHATHU', PULINTHANAM, ENANALLOOR, KOTHAMANGALAM, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 686671 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 -16-

4 THE REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 5. THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER, DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE

MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -17-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 27099 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SHIBYMOL M AGED 55 YEARS DAUGHTER OF KAUSALYA MADHAVAN, 'MUKALETHUPARAMBIL', VETTICKAL PO, THIRUVANIYOOR, MULANTHURUTHY, ERNAKULAM. , PIN - 682314 2 UNNINARAYANAN O AGED 56 YEARS SON OF GANGADHARAN NAIR, 'PUNATHIL', CHOOOLUR, NIT CAMPUS PO, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673601 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA

1. REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,

MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, -18-

SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR, COMBINED COUNCIL

BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011 6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADVS. Kiran M.S., CGC SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -19-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 27188 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SHYLEJA S AGED 48 YEARS DAUGHTER OF C N SIVAKUMAR, 'CHITTETTU PADINJAREMURIYIL, PATHANAD, KANGAZHA, KOTTAYAM, PIN - 686541 2 HEMANT KUMAR R AGED 55 YEARS SON OF R RAMACHANDRAN NAIR, TC 28/1348, MAIDAN VILLA, HINDU MISSION ROAD, GPO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, -20-

THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011 6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR, N.RAGHURAJ, SC THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -21-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 27212 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 LAILA AGED 50 YEARS DAUGHTER OF ABDUL KHADER, 'MAILADUMPARA PLAVILA VEEDU', VALIYAKALUNGU, PARANDODE PO, ARYANAND, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695542 2 SHAHUL HAMEED A AGED 61 YEARS SON OF ABUBAKKAR KUNJU, 'SHAJINA MANZIL', MALAYANTHERI, PARANDODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695542 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE CHAIRMAN NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8,

DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI , PIN - 110077 3 THE STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, -22-

THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 THE REGISTRAR KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 6 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADVS. S.JUSTUS SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU; GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -23-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 27216 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 OMANA M AGED 50 YEARS DAUGHTER OF MARY, 'UDAYA BHAVAN', CHERUVALLY, KEEZHTHONNAKKAL, SANTHIGIRI PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695589 2 JAYAKUMAR V AGED 59 YEARS SON OF VELAYUDHAN PILLAI, 'VEMOOTILVEEDU', POOLANTHARA, SANTHIGIRI PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695589 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S:

1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN MEDICINE

-24-

REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011 6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673 BY ADVS. N.J.ASHWIN,CGC SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -25-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 29282 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SANGEETHA JOBY AGED 51

YEARS WIFE OF JOBY S URALATH, 'URALATH HOUSE', NANDHI, VELLANI PO, KARALAM, THRISSUR, PIN - 680701 2 JOBY S URALATH AGED 54 YEARS SON OF SUBRAMANIAN, 'URALATH HOUSE', NANDHI, VELLANI PO, KARALAM, THRISSUR, PIN - 680701 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S:

1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 NATIONAL MEDICAL COMMISSION REPRESENTED BY THE CHAIRMAN, POCKET - 14, SECTOR 8, DWARAKA PHASE - I, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110077 3 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 4 KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCIL FOR MODERN

-26-

MEDICINE, REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM REPRESENTED BY THE REGISTRAR, COMBINED COUNCIL BUILDING, RED CROSS ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695035 5 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, PIN - 682011 6 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV SHRI.N.RAGHURAJ, SC, KERALA STATE MEDICAL COUNCILS

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT

PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -27-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 29646 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SHEENA AGED 41 YEARS WIFE OF PRAKASAN, 'EDAKKATT HOUSE', EDAKKARA PO, PUNNAYUR, THRISSUR, PIN - 680518 2 PRAKASAN AGED 55 YEARS SON OF VASU, 'EDAKKATT HOUSE', EDAKKARA PO, PUNNAYUR THRISSUR, PIN - 680518 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER -28- DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV MINI GOPINATH -CGC . OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -29-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C)

NO. 30545 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SUCHITHRA BABU AGED 48 YEARS WIFE OF M P BABU, 'CHAITHRAM', VALLICODE PO, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689642 2 M.P. BABU AGED 59 YEARS SON OF PRABHAKARAN, 'CHAITHRAM', VALLICODE PO, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - 689642 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER -30- DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673 BY ADV N.RAGUHURAJ BY ADV P.VANDANA OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -31-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 31769 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SHARMILA P.M. AGED 50 YEARS WIFE OF BABU K, 'KAYANEDATH', MUTHAMBI, NADERI PO, ARIKKULAM, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673020 2 BABU K AGED 56 YEARS SON OF UNNARAKKUTTY, 'KAYANEDATH', MUTHAMBI, NADERI PO, ARIKKULAM, KOZHIKODE., PIN - 673020 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION

OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER, -32- DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -33-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 32268 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 GIGI VARGHESE AGED 52 YEARS WIFE OF JAMES GEORGE, VALLAPURACKAL KANYAKONIL', PACHA, CHEKKIDIKKADU PO, EDATHUA, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 689573 2 JAMES GEORGE AGED 52 YEARS SON OF A O GEORGE, 'EDATHIPARAMPIL HOUSE', PARUMALA PO, THIRUVALLA, KADAPRA, PATHANAMTHITTA, PIN - BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI NEETHU S. RESPONDENT/S: 1 THE UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE

DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH -34- ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -35-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 32275 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 DR. SUNITHA MONI AGED 56 YEARS WIFE OF ASOK LAL G, TC 4/1397, YGRA 2, KURAVANKONAM, KOWDIAR PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003 2 ASOK LAL G AGED 57 YEARS SON OF P GANESAN, TC 4/1397, YGRA 2, KURAVANKONAM, KOWDIAR PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI NEETHU S. RESPONDENT/S: 1 THE UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH -36- ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA , PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA,

PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -37-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 32329 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SABIRA AGED 49 YEARS WIFE OF MAMMAD KOYA, 'ERAVATTUKANDY', KAKKANCHERI, ULLIYERI, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673620 2 MAMMAD KOYA AGED 57 YEARS SON OF IMPICHIMOITHY, 'ERAVATTUKANDY', KAKKANCHERI, ULLIYERI, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673620 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI NEETHU S. RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI , PIN - 110001 2 THE STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, -38- PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY THE MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -39-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 33128 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 RAJANI JAYAKRISHNAN AGED 49 YEARS WIFE OF JAYAKRISHNAN C N, 'VADAKKEKARA', ANANDAPURAM PO, THRISSUR, PIN - 680305 2 JAYAKRISHNAN C.N. AGED 60 YEARS SON OF C KELU, 'VADAKKEKARA', ANANDAPURAM PO, THRISSUR, PIN - 680305 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER, DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

-40- ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV N.RAGHURAJ BY ADV DEEPA RAJESH OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -41-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 33165 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SREELAJA V AGED 48 YEARS

WIFE OF C K PADMAGIREESAN, SREENIVAS', MEPPAYIL PO, VADAKARA, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673104 2 C.K.PADMAGIREESAN AGED 56 YEARS SON OF C KELU, SREENIVAS', MEPPAYIL PO, VADAKARA, KOZHIKODE, PIN - 673104 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

-42- ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 THE MANAGING DIRECTOR SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 BY ADV SMT.M.SHAJNA, CGC ADV.N.RAGURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -43-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 35095 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 M.K.SHERMILA AGED 50 YEARS WIFE OF ASOKAN K S, 'MADATHUM KANDIYIL HOUSE', NELLUNNI, MATTANNUR PO, CHAVASSERY, THALASSERY, KANNUR, PIN - 670702 2 ASOKAN K.S. AGED 53 YEARS SON OF KRISHNA PILLAI, 'SARADABHAVAN', NEAR CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETY, CHIRAYINKEEZHU PO, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI

NEETHU S. RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH -44- ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -45-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 35582 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 REMYA REMESH AGED 40 YEARS WIFE OF AJITH KUMAR V S, 'VETTARMADATHIL', KUDAYATHOOR, IDUKKI, PIN - 685590 2 AJITH KUMAR V S AGED 59 YEARS SON OF SANKARA PILLA, 'VETTARMADATHIL', KUDAYATHOOR, IDUKKI, PIN - 685590 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI DEVIKA JAYARAJ RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER

DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,

-46- PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -47-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 35841 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 A.R SHYJA AGED 55 YEARS WIFE OF DR, HARIHARAN, 'KURUVAM CHIRA', KURUPPAMKULANGARA, CHERTHALA NORTH, ALAPPUZHA - 688 539 2 DR. HARIHARAN AGED 67 YEARS SON OF NARAYANAN, 'KURUVAM CHIRA', KURUPPAMKULANGARA, CHERTHALA NORTH, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688539 BY ADVS. AKASH S. DEVIKA JAYARAJ GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI RESPONDENT/S:

1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER -48- DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT.LTD. REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA,

PIN - 686673 N.RAGHRAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -49-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 35900 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 INDIRA G AGED 49 YEARS DAUGHTER OF GOVINDAN V S, 880, 'MAMPARAMBIL', A N PURAM, THIRUVAMPADY PO, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688002 2 CHANDRAN K.N. AGED 60 YEARS SON OF NARAYANAN, 'KAROORPARAMBIL', KODAR LANE, ARAKULAM WEST, KODUNGALLOOR PO, THRISSUR, PIN - 680664 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI DEVIKA JAYARAJ RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA , REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT,THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM,

-50- PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE

COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -51-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 35922 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 REMA P AGED 50 YEARS WIFE OF SIVADASAN P V, 'THIRUVATHIRA', PUNTHALA PO, VENMONY, ALAPPUZHA - 689 509, PIN - 689509 2 SIVADASAN P.V AGED 61 YEARS SON OF K VASU, 'THIRUVATHIRA', PUNTHALA PO, VENMONY, ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 689509 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI DEVIKA JAYARAJ RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

-52- ERNAKULAM, KERALA , PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL AND RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA , PIN - 686673 BY ADV SHAIJU K.S., CGC OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; N.RAGHURAJ THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -53-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 36347 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 JOMON C.V. AGED 52 YEARS S/O C.I. VARGHESE, CHAKRAMAKKIL HOUSE, PALUVAI P.O., THRISSUR , PIN - 680522 2 SUNI JOMON AGED 50 YEARS W/O JOMON C.V., CHAKRAMAKKIL HOUSE, PALUVAI P.O., THRISSUR, PIN - 680522 BY ADVS. ALEX.M.SCARIA BEAS K. PONNAPPAN A.J.RIYAS SARITHA THOMAS ALLEN J. CHERUVIL SAHL ABDUL KADER SANJITH KUMAR R. RESPONDENT/S: 1 THE UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 THE STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM , PIN - 695001 3 THE APPROPRIATE AUTHORITY FORMED U/S 12 OF THE ART (R) ACT, 2021 REPRESENTED BY VICE CHAIRPERSON - DR. PREETHI, -54-

ADDITIONAL DIRECTOR OF HEALTH SERVICES (FW), PALAYAM - AIRPORT ROAD, NEAR GENERAL HOSPITAL ROAD JUNCTION, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, KERALA , PIN - 695035 4 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH (RCH) OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK AVENUE, MARINE DRIVE, ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 5 THE AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES PONEKKARA P.O., KOCHI, REPRESENTED BY ITS DIRECTOR, PIN - 682041 BY ADV SRI.SUVIN R.MENON, CGC

OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; ADV.N.RAGHURAJ THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -55-

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE V.G.ARUN MONDAY, THE 19TH DAY OF DECEMBER 2022 / 28TH AGRAHAYANA, WP(C) NO. 37145 OF 2022 PETITIONER/S: 1 SUDHA AGED 51 YEARS WIFE OF KUNHIRAMAN, 'CHAVAYANGATT MEETHAL', KAVIL PO, NADUVANNUR, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673614 2 KUNHIRAMAN AGED 58 YEARS SON OF CHANGARAN, 'CHAVAYANGATT MEETHAL', KAVIL PO, NADUVANNUR, KOZHIKODE , PIN - 673614 BY ADVS. AKASH S. GIRISH KUMAR M S V.S.VARALEKSHMI DEVIKA JAYARAJ RESPONDENT/S: 1 UNION OF INDIA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SASTHRI BHAVAN, NEW DELHI, PIN - 110001 2 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695001 3 THE DISTRICT REPRODUCTIVE & CHILD HEALTH ("RCH") OFFICER DISTRICT MEDICAL OFFICE, ERNAKULAM, PARK EVE, MARINE DRIVE,

-56- ERNAKULAM, KERALA, PIN - 682011 4 SABINE HOSPITAL & RESEARCH CENTRE PVT.LTD. REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING DIRECTOR, PEZHAKKAPPALLY PO, MUVATTUPUZHA, PIN - 686673 ADV.N.RAGHURAJ OTHER PRESENT: AMICUS CURAIE RAMOLA NAYANPALLY; DSGI S.MANU;GP RIYAL DEVASSY; CGC V.GIRISH KUMAR THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 07.12.2022, ALONG WITH WP(C).24508/2022 AND CONNECTED CASES, THE COURT ON 19.12.2022 DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING: -57- CR

JUDGMENT

Dated this the 19th day of December, 2022 [WP(C) Nos.24058/2022, 24508/2022, 25078/2022, The writ petitions are filed by couples undergoing or intending to undergo assisted reproductive services, driven by the desire to have children. The petitioners challenge the upper age limit of 50 years for women and 55 years for men prescribed under the Assisted Reproductive Technology (Regulation) Act,

2021 ('the ART Act' for short), which prohibits the application of ART services to persons above the -58- prescribed age limit. According to the petitioners, prescription of the upper age limit under Section 21 (g) of the ART Act is irrational, arbitrary, unreasonable and violative of their right to reproduction, acknowledged as a fundamental right. They therefore want Section 21(g) of the ART Act, to the extent it prescribes an upper age limit for availing assisted reproductive technology services, to be declared unconstitutional.

2. Heard Advs.Akash Sathyanandan and Alex

Scaria for the petitioners, S.Manu, the Deputy Solicitor General assisted by V. Girish Kumar, for the Central Government, Government Pleader Riyal Devassy for the State Government, N.Raguraj for the Kerala State Medical Council and Ramola Nayanpally, the amicus curiae.

3. Learned Counsel for the petitioners

contended that there is no rationale in prescribing an upper age limit of 55 for men and -59- 50 for women. It is submitted that, prior to the introduction of the ART Act, the National

Guidelines for Accreditation, Supervision and

Regulation of ART Clinics in India' ('the National Guidelines' for short), prepared by the Indian Council for Medical research ("ICMR") and National Academy of Medical Sciences (NAMS) was

in force. Chapter 3 of the National Guidelines

dealt with the 'Code of Practice, Ethical Considerations and Legal Issues". Therein, under the head 'General Considerations' the prescription was only with respect to the minimum age for ART. As no upper age limit was prescribed in the guidelines, the petitioners had opted for ART services, without being unduly worried about their age. Some of the petitioners were in the midst of their treatment when the ART Act came into effect on 25.01.2022, bringing the treatment came to a sudden halt. This has put the petitioners under extreme

emotional stress and -60- some are in the verge of mental breakdown.

4. It is pointed out that, while the

Surrogacy (Regulation) Act introduced with a similar objective contains a transitional provision, the ART Act contains no such provision. It is contended that the rights of individuals to found a family is recognised as a human right by the United Nations and reproductive rights has been recognised as an aspect of personal liberty under Article 21 of the Constitution of India by the Honourable Supreme Court also. In support of this contention reliance is placed on the decisions in *Suchita Srivastava and Anr. v. Chandigarh Administration* [(2009) 9 SCC 1], *K.S. Puttuswamy and another v Union of India* [(2017) 10 SCC 1]

5. Responding with alacrity to this Court's

request for assistance, learned amicus curiae has submitted a detailed report after exhaustive -61- reference to statutes, judgments, parliamentary debates, journal articles and interviews with doctors practicing infertility and reproductive medicine. According to the amicus curiae, the issue of limiting access to assisted reproductive techniques ought to be addressed from the psychological, ethical and social perspectives. From the psychological point of view, being restricted from accessing ART may lead to increased frustration of families who are unable to reproduce naturally. Ethically, objections may arise by measuring the value of life of the newborn against the risks associated with the mothers' advanced age. On the social perspective, it is to be noticed that, with the increased use of ART, administration of such technologies has gained a social value with demographic relevancy. Certain studies have shown that later parenthood is associated with a more stable family environment, a higher socio-economic position, -62- higher income and better living conditions as well as better parenting practices. However, concerns regarding the reduced physical capacity to meet the demands of parenthood, fear of premature parental loss, social stigma and absence of grandparents are projected as reasons for preferring parents of younger age. In addition to the above mentioned aspects, wider considerations such as higher success rates with repeated treatment cycles and role of the State in regulating reproduction also assumes relevance.

6. Referring to Clause 3.1.6 in the 129th

report of the Department Related Parliament Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare, it is pointed out that a Senior Consultant & Professor of AIIMS and a representative from the Department of Reproductive Medicine, Christian Medical College & Hospital, Vellore had submitted that the lower age limit for woman seeking ART -63- services should be more than 20 years and the upper age limit for both men and women should be decided based on factors like risk to maternal health due to pregnancy at advanced maternal age; care of child until 18 years and average life expectancy in India. It is submitted that except noting such suggestions, there was no discussion on the aspects by the experts. To highlight the impracticality in fixing the upper age limit, it is pointed out that, by reason of the upper age limit, a married woman below 50 years will not be permitted to undergo assisted reproductive services if her husband has crossed 55 years of age, while an unmarried woman can avail such service till she attains 50 years.

7. Learned amicus curiae suggested that,

since the National Assisted Reproductive Technology and Surrogacy Board (National Board, constituted in terms of Section 15(1) of the Surrogacy (Regulation) Act is empowered to review -64- and monitor the implementation of the ART Act and recommend suitable changes, it will be apposite to direct the National Board to review the upper age limit and make necessary recommendations to the Central Government.

8. On behalf of the Central Government, it is

submitted that the Department-Related Parliament Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare had considered all relevant aspects before prescribing the upper age limit. After due deliberation, based on inputs received from various stakeholders, the Committee recommended the age criteria of 21 to 50 years for women and 21 to 55 years for men to be the most suitable. The report of the Committee was placed before both the houses of Parliament and passed after due discussion. There is no irrationality in prescribing the upper age limit and no scope for interference with the provisions of a well thought out and well intended

9. Before proceeding to decide the

constitutionality of Section 21(g), it is essential to have an idea about the conception, evolution and introduction of the ART Act. For this purpose, it is necessary to note that the benefits of assisted reproductive techniques came into focus with the birth of Louise Brown, the world's first test tube baby, on 25th July, 1978. About two months later, the world's second and India's first IVF baby, Kanupriya @ Durga was born in Kolkata. Since then, the field of assisted reproductive technology has grown exponentially and India has become one of the major centres for ART services. This gave rise to a multitude of legal, ethical and social issues, in the absence of any prescribed standards or protocols. The Central Government was therefore prompted to call upon the ICMR to draft the National Guidelines for Accreditation, Supervision and Regulation of ART Clinics in -66- India. Later, the Law Commission of India presented its 228th report, recommending active legislative intervention to facilitate the correct use of ART technology and legalisation of surrogacy. Accordingly, the Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare submitted the 102nd report on the Surrogacy Regulation Bill. The Committee observed that along with Surrogacy Regulation, there is an urgent need to regulate ART Clinics across the country. Consequently, the ART (Regulation) Bill was introduced in the Lok Sabha on 14.09.2020 and referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare. The Standing Committee sought the views of stakeholders and Governments and presented the 129th report on the ART (Regulation) Bill, 2020 before the Parliament on 19.03.2021. The Bill was passed on 01.12.2021 and the Act came into force on 25.01.2022. -67-

10. The objective of the ART Act, as

discernible from its preamble, is to regulate and supervise the assisted reproductive technology clinics and banks to prevent misuse and ensure safe and ethical practice of Assisted Reproductive Technology Service etc. As per Section 2(1)(a) of the Act, assisted reproductive technology, with its grammatical variations and cognate expressions, means all techniques that attempt to obtain a pregnancy

by handling the sperm or the oocyte outside the human body and transferring the gamete or the embryo into the reproductive system of a woman. Section 2(1)(e) defines commissioning couple as an infertile married couple who approach an assisted reproductive technology clinic or assisted reproductive technology bank for obtaining the authorised services of that clinic or bank. Section 2(1)(j) defines infertility as the inability to conceive after one year of -68- unprotected coitus or other proven medical condition preventing a couple from conception. Section 2(1)(u) defines a woman to mean any woman above the age of twenty-one years who approaches an assisted reproductive technology clinic or assisted reproductive technology bank for obtaining the authorised services of the clinic or bank. Section 21 of the Act requires the ART clinics and banks to perform certain enumerated duties. As per Section 21(g), the clinics shall apply the assisted reproductive technology services, (i) to a woman above the age of twenty-one years and below the age of fifty years and (ii) to a man above the age of twenty-one years and below the age of fifty-five years.

11. Having carefully perused the report of

the Parliamentary Committee, I find merit in the contention that the prescription of upper age limit is made without much discussion. In the 129th report of the Parliamentary Committee, -69- except referring to the suggestion put forth by the experts regarding the need for prescribing the upper age limit for women/men, there is no discussion on the relevant aspects. The Parliamentary debates on the Assisted Reproductive Technology (Regulation) Bill, 2020 also does not reveal any discussion on the age factor of the commissioning couple. Be that as it may, absence of deliberation by the legislature is not sufficient to hold a statutory provision to be unconstitutional. There could have been discussion regarding the absence of international conventions or treaties regulating ART. Another factor of relevance is that in most of the countries providing ART services, the practice is regulated by domestic legislation, guidelines or both. Countries like Estonia, Greece and Netherlands has set the mother's age limit at 50 years, the Czech Republic at 49 years, Belgium, Bulgaria, Denmark and Ireland at 45 years. At the - 70- same time, countries like France, Germany, Portugal, Spain, Sweden and UK do not have a specified age limit, but prescribes that the maximum age limit of the

mother shall be within the natural reproductive age of a woman. Particularly, the father's age limit is not considered as a factor except in France and Sweden. It is also worthwhile to note that while some studies find advanced paternal age to be having a negative impact on ART outcome, others are of opinion that it has no impact at all. In most cases, it is advised to do pre-implantation genetic testing for embryos created using older father's sperm or aneuploidy screening of sperm cells taken from men of advanced age. As the ART Act mandates pre-implantation genetic testing for embryos, a significant part of the apprehensions pertaining to sperm health of older men stands allayed. These are some of the relevant aspects which could have been taken into consideration -71- while fixing the upper age limit for availing ART services.

12. On the contention that the State cannot

regulate the reproductive choices of its citizens, it may be worthwhile to refer to Article 16(1) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, extracted hereunder; Article 16(1) Men and women of full age, without any limitation due to race, nationality or religion, have the right to marry and to found a family. They are entitled to equal rights as to marriage, during marriage and at its dissolution. In *Suchita Srivastava* (supra), the Apex Court

held reproductive choice of women to be a

dimension of her personal liberty. The

contextually relevant portion of the judgment

reads as under; 22. There is no doubt that a woman's right to make reproductive choices is also a dimension of personal liberty as -72-

understood under Article 21 of the Constitution of India. It is important to recognise that reproductive choices can be exercised to procreate as well as to abstain from procreating. The crucial consideration is that a woman's right to privacy, dignity and bodily integrity should be respected. This means that there should be no restriction whatsoever on the

exercise of reproductive choices such as a woman's right to refuse participation in sexual activity or alternatively the insistence on use of contraceptive methods. Furthermore, women are also free to choose birth control methods such as undergoing sterilisation procedures. Taken to their logical conclusion, reproductive rights include a woman's entitlement to carry a pregnancy to its full term, to give birth and to subsequently raise children. However, in the case of pregnant women there is also a compelling State interest in protecting the life of the prospective child. Therefore, the termination of a pregnancy is only permitted when the conditions specified in the applicable statute have been fulfilled. Hence, the provisions of the MTP Act, 1971 can also be viewed as reasonable restrictions that have been placed on the exercise of reproductive choices.

-73- Later in K.S. Puttuswamy(supra), the Constitution Bench declared family, marriage, procreation and sexual orientation as integral to the dignity of an individual. Paragraph 298 of the judgment is extracted hereunder for easy reference;

298. Privacy of the individual is an essential aspect of dignity. Dignity has both an intrinsic and instrumental value. As an intrinsic value, human dignity is an entitlement or a constitutionally protected interest in itself. In its instrumental facet, dignity and freedom are inseparably intertwined, each being a facilitative tool to achieve the other. The ability of the individual to protect a zone of privacy enables the realisation of the full value of life and liberty. Liberty has a broader meaning of which privacy is a subset. All liberties may not be exercised in privacy. Yet others can be fulfilled only within a private space. Privacy enables the individual to retain the autonomy of the body and mind. The autonomy of the individual is the ability to make decisions on vital matters of concern to life. Privacy has not been couched as an independent fundamental right. But that

does not detract from the constitutional protection afforded to it, once the true nature of privacy and its relationship with those fundamental rights which are expressly protected is understood. Privacy lies across the spectrum of protected freedoms. The guarantee of equality is a guarantee against arbitrary State action. It prevents the State from discriminating between individuals. The destruction by the State of a sanctified personal space whether of the body or of the mind is violative of the guarantee against arbitrary State action. Privacy of the body entitles an individual to the integrity of the physical aspects of personhood. The intersection between one's mental integrity and privacy entitles the individual to freedom of thought, the freedom to believe in what is right, and the freedom of self-determination. When these guarantees intersect with gender, they create a private space which protects all those elements which are crucial to gender identity. The family, marriage, procreation and sexual orientation are all integral to the dignity of the individual. Above all, the privacy of the individual recognises an inviolable right to determine how freedom shall be exercised. An individual may

-75-

perceive that the best form of expression is to remain silent. Silence postulates a realm of privacy. An artist finds reflection of the soul in a creative endeavour. A writer expresses the outcome of a process of thought. A musician contemplates upon notes which musically lead to silence. The silence, which lies within, reflects on the ability to choose how to convey thoughts and ideas or interact with others. These are crucial aspects of personhood. The freedoms under Article 19 can be fulfilled where the individual is entitled to decide upon his or her preferences. Read in conjunction with Article 21, liberty enables the individual to have a choice of preferences on various facets of life including what and how one will eat, the way one will dress, the faith one will espouse and a myriad other matters on which autonomy and self-

determination require a choice to be made within the privacy of the mind. The constitutional right to the freedom of religion under Article 25 has implicit within it the ability to choose a faith and the freedom to express or not express those choices to the world. These are some illustrations of the manner in which

-76-

privacy facilitates freedom and is intrinsic to the exercise of liberty. The Constitution does not contain a separate article telling us that privacy has been declared to be a fundamental right. Nor have we tagged the provisions of Part III with an alpha-suffixed right to privacy: this is not an act of judicial redrafting. Dignity cannot exist without privacy. Both reside within the inalienable values of life, liberty and freedom which the Constitution has recognised. Privacy is the ultimate expression of the sanctity of the individual. It is a constitutional value which straddles across the spectrum of fundamental rights and protects for the individual a zone of choice and self- determination.

(emphasis supplied)

13. Thus, the personal choice of individuals

to procreate and build family is held to be a facet of his/her fundamental right. This right is being restricted by fixing an upper age limit for availing ART services. While the State has the power to impose reasonable restrictions, such restriction can always be tested on the -77- touchstone of liberty guaranteed under Article

21. It is now settled that legislative action can

be challenged on the ground of lack of legislative competence, violation of fundamental rights or any other constitutional provision and manifest arbitrariness. In *Shayara Bano v. Union of India* [(2017) 9 SCC 1], the Apex Court has termed 'manifest arbitrariness' as something done by the legislature capriciously, irrationally and/or without adequate determining principle. Also, when something is

done which is excessive and disproportionate, such legislation would be manifestly arbitrary. At the same time, this Court has to be mindful of the principle of 'presumption of constitutionality of legislations'. On a careful balancing of the above principles, I find it difficult to hold the prescription of upper age limit in Section 21(g) to be so excessive and arbitrary as to warrant judicial interference. At the same time, I find -78- the imposition of age restriction, without even a transitional provision, to be irrational and arbitrary. As mentioned earlier, some of the petitioners were undergoing assisted reproductive technology services when the ART Act was introduced on 25.01.2022. The prohibition under Section 21(g), if understood to be preventing even continuance of ART services already commenced, would definitely amount to unreasonable and unjustified restriction on the reproductive choice of the commissioning couple and would militate against the liberty guaranteed under Article 21.

14. As rightly pointed out by the amicus

curiae, Section 5 of the Act confers the National Assisted Reproductive Technology and Surrogacy Board with the power to advise the Central Government on policy matters relating to assisted reproductive technology. In my opinion, the impact of the prescription of upper age limit -79- on the liberty of individuals is a matter which the National Board should bring to the notice of the Central Government, so as to effectuate a detailed discussion on the subject and pave the way for necessary amendments. Based on the above discussion, the following directions are issued;

- (i) Those among the petitioners who were undergoing ART services as on 25.01.2022 shall be permitted to continue their treatment.
- (ii) The National Board shall alert the Central Government about the need for having a re-look at the upper age limit prescribed in Section 21(g) of the Act.
- (iii) The National Board shall also bring to the notice of the Central Government the requirement of including a transitional provision in the ART Act.

(iv) The above directions shall be complied by the National Board within three months of -80- receipt of a copy of this judgment.

(v) Those among the petitioners who are yet to commence their ART treatment shall await the decision of the Central Government on the upper age limit and the transitional provision.

(vi) The liberty of the petitioners to

approach this Court at a later stage, if so necessitated, is reserved. I place on record my appreciation for the immense help rendered by the learned amicus curiae. Sd/- V.G.ARUN JUDGE Sc/ -81- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 24058/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER OF THE

INSPECTOR GENERAL, STS BSF, BANGALORE NUMBERED AS EXT/STS/BSF/VOL RET VP/2021/21088-97 DATED 10.11.2021, Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND OTHER HOSPITAL RECORDS OF THE PETITIONERS OBTAINED FROM THE 7TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 29.11.2021 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF

THE NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ('NATIONAL GUIDELINES'), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ('ICMR') AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

RESPONDENT EXHIBITS Exhibit R1(a) Relevant extract of Report no. 129 of Rajya Sabha -82- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 24508/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE PASSPORT OF

THE 2ND PETITIONER, THAT WOULD SHOW HIS VISA STAMPING AND THE LAST ENTRY IN INDIA, Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND

OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND OTHER HOSPITAL RECORDS DATED 13.09.2021 AND MEDICAL RECORDS DATED 23.09.2021 OF THE PETITIONERS, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF THE OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -83- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 25078/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3(a) TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT DATED 17.06.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P3(b) TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 17.06.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P3(c) TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT DATED 21.12.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P3(d) TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 21.12.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND LABORATORY REPORT DATED 05.09.2020 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY

FROM ASTER MEDICITY KOCHI, ERNAKULAM DATED 30.08.2022 -84-
APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26011/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE
COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE
COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE
COPY OF THE OPERATION NOTES OF THE HYSTEROSCOPIC AND
LAPAROSCOPIC MYOMECTOMY TREATMENT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
DATED 02.10.2013 Exhibit P3(a) TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY
OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 03.10.2013 ISSUED BY RAJI NURSING
HOME, CHEMBUKKAVU, THRISSUR Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT
OF THE HYSTEROSCOPY AND LAPAROSCOPIC MYOMECTOMY
CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 24.05.2016 Exhibit P4(a)
TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF

THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 28.05.2016 ISSUED BY THE CRAFT HOSPITAL
& RESEARCH CENTRE, KODUNGALLUR, THRISSUR Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY
OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY
CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE, CHERANALLORE, EDAPALLY (VIA), KOCHI,
Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL
GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF
ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE
INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL
ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION
MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-85- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26035/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE
COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE
COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE
COPY OF THE DETAILS OF THE TREATMENT AT PUTHENPURACKAL
AYURVEDA PHARMACY, EDAMATTOM FROM 22.10.2018 TO 28.11.2019
Exhibit P4(a) TRUE COPY OF THE OBSTETRICS USG SCAN REPORT DATED
30.06.2022 AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P4(b) TRUE COPY
OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 30.06.2022 AT THE 6TH
RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES
OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -86- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26066/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND OBSTETRICS SCAN REPORT AND THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 12.09.2019 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, OBTAINED FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-87- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26559/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND PELVIC SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 16.08.2017 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE SEMEN ANALYSIS REPORT OF THE 2ND PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 16.08.2017 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE ISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 19.09.2017 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE REAL TIME B-MODE TAS

- 3D/TVS/DOPPLER, ULTRASONOGRAPHY REPORT ISSUED BY THE MEDISERV DIAGNOSTICS, CALICUT DATED 18.04.2019 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRASOUND FOLLICULAR STUDY CONDUCTED AT CLEAR SCAN & DIAGNOSTIC CENTRE, KOTTAPARAMBA, KOZHIKODE - 1 DATED 09.11.2020

Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY

ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 29.10.2021 OF THE PETITIONERS Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 18.02.2022 AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE OBSTETRICS ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 19.02.2022 AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL -88- RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-89- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 26563/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF TEHE AADHAR CARD OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF TEH 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF TEH DISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM LAKSHMI HOSPITAL DATED 30.08.2012 IN RESPECT OF THE PETITIONERS Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY FROM INDIRA GANDHI CO-OPERATIVE HOSPITAL DATED 25.11.2013 IN RESPECT OF TEH PETITIONERS Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 12.05.2014 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 23.02.2015 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 01.10.2015 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL DATED 16.10.2018 Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE OBSTETRICS USG SCAN REPORT DATED 25.05.2022 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 25.05.2022 OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER

AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE
RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"),
PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR")
AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF
THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR
2005 -90- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27099/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1
TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2
TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3
TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE DATED 15.06.2019 OF
THE PETITIONERS Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF
ABDOMEN AND PELVIS CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY
DR. SHAJI'S MRI AND MEDICAL RESEARCH CENTRE PVT. LTD., AT THE
REFERENCE OF THE HOMOEOPATHIC DOCTOR DATED 22.04.2021

Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT DATED 13.08.2022
OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KOKOORI LAPAROSCOPIC AND
IVF CLINIC Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE CYTOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST
PETITIONER, ISSUED BY CPC MEDICAL LABORATORY Exhibit P7 TRUE
COPY OF THE LETTER OF THE DISTRICT CHIEF OF POLICE, KOZHIKODE
CITY ISSUED ON 24.05.2022, AT THE RELIEVING THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND
REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"),
PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR")
AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF
THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR
2005

-91- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27188/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE
COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE
COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE

COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE ART TREATMENT CONDUCTED ON THE PETITIONERS AT CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE DATED 13.11.2018 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF EMBRYO TRANSFER DONE ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE, DATED 04.06.2019 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF DISCHARGE

SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE

CIMAR FERTILITY CENTRE, DATED 18.06.2019 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE MITERA HOSPITAL DATED 25.09.2019 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE MITERA HOSPITAL DATED 21.10.2019 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE MITERA HOSPITAL DATED 24.10.2019 Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-92- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27212/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE USG REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE WOMEN AND CHILDREN HOSPITAL, THYCAUD DATED 10.08.2017 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL EXAMINATION REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE WOMEN AND CHILDREN HOSPITAL, THYCAUD DATED 23.08.2017 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-93- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 27216/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AAHAAR CARD OF TEH 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE DATED 03.01.2021 BETWEEN THE PETITIONERS Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF PELVIS CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 31.08.2021 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE FOLLICULAR MONITORING REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 6TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

RESPONDENT EXHIBITS Exhibit R1(A) TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT EXTRACT OF REPORT NO. 129 OF THE RAJYA SABHA -94- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 29282/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF

THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED BY A COUNSULTANT RADIOLOGIST AND SONOLOGIST, DR. MILIND S GUNE, DATED 13.06.2003

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY

FROM THE MEDICAL COLLEGE HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, DATED 27.05.2005
Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE LAB TEST RESULT AT CRAFT HOSPITAL AND
RESEARCH CENTRE DATED 29.11.2007

Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY

ISSUED BY THE BENZER NURSING HOME, ANDHERI, MUMBAI DATED
24.01.2010 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF
THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE POLYCLINIC
PRIVATE LIMITED, DATED 25.03.2011 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA
SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
AT THE ORIGIN INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE,
MAHARASHTRA, DATED 19.10.2012 Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE
DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ORIGIN
INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED
28.11.2012 Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE IVF/ICSI SUMMARY OF THE 1ST
PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ORIGIN INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE,
THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED 10.01.2013 Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE
DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ORIGIN
INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY CENTRE, THANE, MAHARASHTRA, DATED
15.01.2013 -95- Exhibit P12 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN
REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED
AT AMBERNATH DIAGNOSTIC CENTRE, AMBERNATH, MAHARASHTRA,
DATED 04.07.2014 Exhibit P13 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN
REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED
AT THE BISHOP ALAPATT MISSION HOSPITAL, KRANCHIRA, KATTOOR,
DATED 17.03.2016, Exhibit P14 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN

REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER,
CONDUCTED AT THE BISHOP ALAPATT MISSION HOSPITAL, KRANCHIRA,
KATTOOR, DATED 17.10.2016 Exhibit P15 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA
SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE UPPER ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST

PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT THE BISHOP ALAPATT MISSION HOSPITAL, KRANCHIRA, KATTOOR, DATED 16.11.2017

Exhibit P16 TRUE COPY OF THE ICSI PROTOCOL SUMMARY

OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KARE CENTRE: INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, THRISSUR, DATED 26.07.2018 Exhibit P17 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -96- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 29646/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 2ND PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE DAYA GENERAL HOSPITAL AND SPECIALTY SURGICAL CENTRE, THRISSUR DATED 02.12.2001 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER CONDUCTED AT THE SANTHI NURSING HOME, PUNNAYURKULAM, THRISSUR Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 27.05.2020, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC HOSPITAL, THRISSUR Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 2ND PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT JEEVA SPECIALITY LABORATORY, THRISSUR, AT THE DIRECTION OF THE HOMOEOPATHIC PRACTITIONER OF THE JANANI PROGRAM, DATED 01.06.2020

Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT OF THE ABDOMEN OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT JEEVA SPECIALITY LABORATORY, THRISSUR DATED 01.06.2020 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 28.10.2020, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC

HOSPITAL, THRISSUR Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 23.12.2020, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC -97- HOSPITAL, THRISSUR Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS OF THE 2ND PETITIONER DATED 17.02.2021, ISSUED BY THE INFERTILITY TREATMENT CENTRE, DISTRICT HOMOEOPATHIC HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN

REPORT OF THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, CONDUCTED AT JEEVA SPECIALITY LABORATORY, THRISSUR, AT THE DIRECTION OF THE HOMOEOPATHIC PRACTITIONER OF THE JANANI PROGRAM, DATED 15.03.2021 Exhibit P12 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

Exhibit R1(a) True copy of relevant extract of Report No. 129 presented to Rajya Sabha on 19.03.2021 -98- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 30545/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF

THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE LIFELINE SUPER SPECIALTY HOSPITAL, ADOOR, PATHANAMTHITTA DATED 24.12.2011

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 05.09.2019, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 27.12.2019 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGE OF THE 2ND PETITIONER'S PASSPORT SHOWING THE IMMIGRATION STAMP DATED 21.09.2021 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE

RELEVANT PAGE OF THE 2ND PETITIONER'S PASSPORT SHOWING THE IMMIGRATION STAMP DATED 29.08.2022 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 15.09.2022, ISSUED BY THE 4THRESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-99- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 31769/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE NATIONAL HOSPITAL, KOZHIKODE DATED 18.04.2007 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE NATIONAL HOSPITAL, KOZHIKODE DATED 30.07.2008 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DIAGNOSTIC REPORT OF

THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE PREMIER DIAGNOSTICS AND RESEARCH CENTRE, KOZHIKODE, DATED 01.08.2008 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ASIAN REPRODUCTIVE MEDICINE CENTRE, PUTHIYARA, KOZHIKODE, DATED 11.12.2011

Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE TRANSVAGINAL SONOGRAPHY REPORT DATED 24.12.2012 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY RAJENDRA NURSING HOME, CALICUT Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT DATED 19.06.2015 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY VINDHYA CLINICAL LAB, CALICUT Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN REPORT DATED 11.09.2017 OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY ORBITO ASIA LABS AND SCANS, CALICUT Exhibit P10 TRUE

COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION

DATED 21.02.2018 ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER, BY DOCTOR AT ARC INTERNATIONAL FERTILITY AND RESEARCH CENTRE, CHENNAI Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE SALINE SONO HYSTEROGRAPHY REPORT DATED 10.03.2018 -100- OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY BABY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL LTD, KOZHIKODE Exhibit P12 TRUE COPY OF THE THE FERTILITY HORMONAL ASSAY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, AND DATED 26.03.2019 Exhibit P13 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 12.03.2019 Exhibit P14 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 30.06.2020 Exhibit P15 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 22.07.2021 Exhibit P16 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE NAHA'S CENTRE FOR ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ENDOSCOPY, NAHAS HOSPITAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED 09.10.2021 Exhibit P17 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 28.01.2022, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P18 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF

-101- OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -102- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32268/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE DOCTOR AT DR. LEELAMMA CLINIC IN DOHA, QATAR
Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE PELVIC SCAN REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE SAMAD IVF HOSPITAL, PATTOOR, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, ON 18.09.2018
Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 25.12.2019
Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE FINAL REPORT OF THE

PROCEDURES CONDUCTED ON 1ST PETITIONER AT THE WOMEN'S WELLNESS AND RESEARCH CENTER, QATAR, DATED 05.01.2020
Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -103- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32275/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS
Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER
Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -104- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 32329/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS
Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER.
Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER
Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE

FOLLICULAR ULTRASOUND STUDY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE AUREOLA MEDICAL CENTRE, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE DATED

21.11.1997 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE FOLLICULAR ULTRASOUND STUDY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE AUREOLA MEDICAL CENTRE, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE DATED 18.12.1997 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE FOLLICULAR ULTRASOUND STUDY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE AUREOLA MEDICAL CENTRE, MAVOOR ROAD, KOZHIKODE DATED 22.12.1997

Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL RECORDS INDICATING THAT THE 1ST PETITIONER UNDERWENT LAPAROSCOPY ON 07.08.2000 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT OF THE HORMONAL TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE ENDOCRINE LABORATORY AND CLINIC, PONKUNNAM, THRISSUR, DATED 07.08.2000 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE USG SCAN REPORT OF THE PELVIC REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER DATED 02.03.2020, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE ADVICE TO THE 1ST PETITIONER TO UNDERGO HYSTEROSCOPIC POLYPECTOMY, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 03.03.2020 Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' -105- ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-106- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33128/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE MYOMECTOMY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE KARE HOSPITAL, DATED ON 11.06.2007 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE ICSI PROCEDURE CARRIED OUT ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KARE HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, ON 17.04.2008 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL ADVICE TO THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE KARE HOSPITAL, THRISSUR, ON 17.04.2008 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST

PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 03.08.2021 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 23.11.2021 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-107- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 33165/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE HYSTEROSCOPY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CRAFT HOSPITAL, DATED ON 09.04.2004 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE PELVISCOPY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CRAFT HOSPITAL, DATED ON 16.04.2004 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE BABY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL, CALICUT, ON 02.12.2008 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ASIAN REPRODUCTIVE MEDICINE CENTRE, KOZHIKODE, ON 10.03.2011 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE ASIAN REPRODUCTIVE MEDICINE CENTRE, KOZHIKODE, ON 19.09.2010 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE HYSTEROSCOPY CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 14.03.2021 Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF IVF PROCEDURE CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 16.10.2021 Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY -108- OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-109- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35095/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE OF THE PETITIONERS DATED 16.12.2016 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE DR. MOLLY M DAS MEMORIAL TRUST V V CLINIC, ATTINGAL, DATED ON 13.07.2017 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE PRESCRIPTION FOR

CONDUCTING VARIOUS TESTS, ISSUED BY THE CONSULTANT GYNECOLOGIST AT TALUK HOSPITAL, CHIRAYINKEEZHU, DATED 08.03.2021 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE SONOGRAPHY CONDUCTED ON THE ABDOMINAL REGION OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE METRO SCANS AND LABORATORY, ATTINGAL, DATED 10.02.2020 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE LABORATORY REPORT, BASED ON THE TESTS CONDUCTED ON THE 2ND PETITIONER, DATED 10.02.2020 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE 'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-110- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35582/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE IVF PROCEDURE ISSUED BY THE

CRAFT HOSPITAL, KODUNGALLUR, DATED 29.12.2011 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED ON 08.12.2015 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 20.12.2015 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE SEMEN ANALYSIS REPORT OF THE 2ND PETITIONER, ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 11.03.2016 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE SCAN CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT MITERA HOSPITAL, KOTTAYAM, DATED 08.11.2021 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE BLOOD TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT MITERA HOSPITAL, KOTTAYAM, DATED 02.12.2021 Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -111- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35841/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE SAMAD IVF HOSPITAL, PATTOOR, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, THAT ALSO SUMMARIZES PREVIOUS TREATMENTS, DATED ON 20.02.2016 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ADVICE FOR IVF PROCEDURE AND THE RECEIPT OF PAYMENT, ISSUED BY SAMAD IVF HOSPITAL, PATTOOR, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, DATED 01.10.2016

Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE ULTRASOUND SCAN CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 06.12.2021 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE BLOOD TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 06.12.2021 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE

RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-112- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35900/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF MARRIAGE ISSUED BY THE VILANJOOR SREE BHAGAVATHI TEMPLE TRUST (PVT) DATED 06.07.2019 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ULTRA SOUND SCAN OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE DIAL SCANS, ALAPPUZHA, DATED ON 01.06.2020 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

-113- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 35922/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF TEH 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE SBM HOSPITAL, KARUNAGAPPALLY, DATED 28.08.2017 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 02.07.2018 Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 29.07.2018 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST

PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 11.09.2018 Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 12.11.2018 Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE MEDICAL PRESCRIPTION ISSUED TO THE 1ST PETITIONER BY THE AYURVEDIC PRACTITIONER, DATED 26.12.2018 Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE SCAN CONDUCTED ON THE 1ST PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 07.06.2021 Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT OF THE SEMEN ANALYSIS TEST CONDUCTED ON THE 2ND PETITIONER, AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 07.06.2021 Exhibit1 P11 TRUE COPY OF THE SUMMARY OF THE IVF TREATMENT CONDUCTED AT THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 16.10.2021 -114- Exhibit1 P12 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY OF THE 1ST PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE 4TH RESPONDENT HOSPITAL, DATED 04.12.2021 Exhibit P13 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005 -115- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 36347/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE MARRIAGE CERTIFICATE DATED 08/11/2022 OF THE PETITIONERS. Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE DEATH CERTIFICATE DATED Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE VARIOUS LAB REPORTS AND TREATMENT BILL OF THE PETITIONERS.

Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ART TREATMENT SUMMARY

DATED 22/09/2021 ISSUED BY AMRITA FERTILITY CENTER. Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY DATED GYNECOLOGY DEPARTMENT OF AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCE & RESEARCH CENTER. Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE DISCHARGE SUMMARY DATED FROM THE GYNECOLOGY DEPARTMENT OF AMRITA INSTITUTE OF

MEDICAL SCIENCE & RESEARCH CENTER. Exhibit P7 TRUE COPY OF THE PELVIC SCAN REPORT DATED FROM AMRITA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCE & RESEARCH CENTER. Exhibit P8 TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION DATED BY THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE. Exhibit P9 TRUE COPY OF THE GAZETTE NOTIFICATION DATED 18/12/2021 OF THE ASSISTED REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGY (REGULATION) ACT, 2021. Exhibit P10 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

GAZETTE NOTIFICATION, BEARING NO. G.S.R. 419 (E) DATED 07/06/2022 PASSED BY THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE.

Exhibit P11 TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION DATED G.O(P)NO.25/2022/H&FWDD. -116- APPENDIX OF WP(C) 37145/2022 PETITIONER EXHIBITS Exhibit P1 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 1ST PETITIONER Exhibit P2 TRUE COPY OF THE AADHAAR CARD OF THE 2ND PETITIONER Exhibit P3 TRUE COPY OF THE ENDOCRINOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CIMAR HOSPITAL, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED ON 13.07.2016 Exhibit P4 TRUE COPY OF THE ENDOCRINOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CIMAR HOSPITAL, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED ON 19.11.2016, Exhibit P5 TRUE COPY OF THE ENDOCRINOLOGY REPORT OF THE 1ST PETITIONER AT THE CIMAR HOSPITAL, EDAPPAL, MALAPPURAM, DATED ON 21.11.2017 Exhibit P6 TRUE COPY OF THE RELEVANT PAGES OF THE

'NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR ACCREDITATION, SUPERVISION AND REGULATION OF ART CLINICS IN INDIA' ("NATIONAL GUIDELINES"), PREPARED BY THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH ("ICMR") AND NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (NAMS), ON BEHALF OF THE UNION MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE, OF THE YEAR 2005

SooperKanoon - India's Premier Online Legal Search - sooperkanoon.com