SooperKanoon - India's Premier Online Legal Search - sooperkanoon.com

C.P.Ajithkumar vs State of Kerala,

C.P.Ajithkumar vs State of Kerala,

SooperKanoon Citation : sooperkanoon.com/1282582

Court : Kerala Orders

Decided On : Feb-13-2025

Judge : Honourable Mr. Justice Devan Ramachandran

Appeal No. : WP(C)/32680/2008

Appellant : C.P.Ajithkumar

Respondent : State of Kerala,

Judgement :

C.R.

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE DEVAN RAMACHANDRAN FRIDAY, THE 18TH DAY OF OCTOBER 2019 / 26TH ASWINA, 1941 PETITIONERS: 1 C.P.AJITHKUMAR AGED 41 YEARS PROPRIETOR, SUBURBAN TRAVELS, MAMANGALAM, COCHIN-24,(PRESIDENT, TRAVEL, OPERATORS ASSOCIATION OF KERALA). 2 KERALA MERCHANTS UNION (FORMERLY ERNAKULAM MERCHANTS UNION), MERCHANTS UNION BUILDING, MERCHANTS UNION ROAD, COCHIN-11, REPRESENTED BY ITS GENERAL SECRETARY. BY ADV. SRI.TOM K.THOMAS RESPONDENTS: 1 STATE OF KERALA, REPRESENTED BY SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT, (ROADS), GOVT.SECRETARIAT,

TRIVANDRUM. 2 THE SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, FINANCE DEPARTMENT, GOVT.SECRETARIAT, TRIVANDRUM. 3 THE CHIEF ENGINEER, PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT (ROADS), TRIVANDRUM. 4 CORPORATION OF COCHIN, REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY, BOAT JETTY, ERNAKULAM. 5 GREATER COCHIN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY, KADAVANTHARA, ERNAKULAM, COCHIN-20, REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY. 6 ADDL.R6.THE CHIEF ENGINEER, (NATIONAL HIGHWAYS), TRIVANDRUM-695033. 7 ADDL.R7.THE REGIONAL OFFICER, NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY OF INDIA, OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ENGINEER, (NATIONAL HIGHWAYS), TRIVANDRUM-695033.

(ADDDL. R6 AND R7 ARE IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER

DATED 28.11.2088 INIA.15338/2008). 8 ADDL.R8.THE PROJECT DIRECTOR, PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION UNIT COCHIN, NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY OF INDIA, MANGALYA VAIDHYA MADOM, VYTILA, ERNAKULAM. 9 ADDL.R9.THE PROJECT DIRECTOR, PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION UNIT PALAKKAD, NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY OF INDIA, ARMUGHAM COLONY, CHANDRA NAGAR, PALAKKAD. (ADDL.R8 AND R9 ARE IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER DATED 17.12.2008 IN .I.A.16206/2008.) 10 ADDL.R10.UNION OF INDIA, REP. BY SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT, CENTRAL SECRETARIAT, NEW DELHI. (ADDL.R10 IS IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER 30.03.2009 DATED IN I.A.4647/2009.) 11 ADDL.R11.CENTRE FOR CONSUMER EDUCATION, MARKET ROAD, PALAI, REPRESENTED BY ITS MANAGING TRUSTEE DEJO KAPPAN, AGED 54, S/O.LATE K.C.JOSEPH, RESIDING AT 17 A, PRESIDENCY HOMES, KALOOR, ERNAKULAM. (ADDL.R11 IS IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER 12.10.2011 DATED IN IA.15616/2011.) 12 ADDL.R12. KERALA GOVERNMENT CONTRACTORS ASSOCIATION, HEAD OFFICE SREEKUMAR BUILDING, IRON BRIDGES.P.O., ALAPPUZHA-688001, REPRESENTED BY ITS PRESIDENT VARGHESE KANNAMPALLY 13 ADDL.R13.P.R.ASHOKUMAR, RAMAPRIYA, PARAYAKADU.P.O., CHERTHALA, ALAPPUZHA DISTRICT-688001.

(ADDL.R12 AND R13 ARE IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER

DATED 18.10.2011 IN I.A.15475/2011.) 14 ADDL.R14.THE DISTRICT COLLECTOR, ERNAKULAM.

(ADDL.R14 IS SUO MOTU IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER

DATED 11.10.2019 IN WPC.)

R1 BY ADV. SRI.BENHUR JOSEPH MANAYANI R1 BY ADV. SRI.S.KRISHNAMOORTHY CGC R1, R8 BY GOVERNMENT PLEADER R1 BY ADV. SRI.JOHNSON MANAYANI R1 BY ADV. SRI.JOMY GEORGE R1 BY ADV. SRI.JEEVAN MATHEW MANAYANI R1 BY ADV. SRI.SEBASTIAN THOMAS R1 BY ADV. SRI.C.M.SURESH BABUSCCOCHIN CORPORATI R1 BY ADV. SRI.M.K.THANKAPPANSCGCDAGREATER COCH R1 BY ADV. SRI.BABU KARUKAPADATHSCCOCHIN CORPORA R1 BY ADV. SRI.THOMAS ANTONY

SRI. C.P. SUDHAKARAPRASAD- A.G, SRI. K.V.MANOJ KUMAR -SR.G.P, SRI. S.SUDHISH KUMAR -S.C THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING BEEN FINALLY HEARD ON 18.10.2019, THE COURT ON THE SAME DAY DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:

JUDGMENT

This writ petition is one of the longest pending writ petitions of this Court - not surprising, because this case calls into focus a rather vexatious problem faced by our citizens day in and day out; but which has eluded any resolution even as on date.

2. The petitioners complain about the pathetic road conditions in Kerala and in particular, the Queen of the Arabian Sea - the City of Kochi.

3. The petitioners rue that in the last more than ten years

this writ petition has been pending before this Court, the situation of the roads has not merely bettered, but has, in fact, drastically deteriorated. They, therefore, pray that stringent and effective directions be now issued to all stakeholders and especially to the Institutions in which the various roads are vested; with a corollary plea that the Government be directed to insist on a minimum five year performance guarantee from the Contractor/ Agency which is entrusted with the work of laying new roads and repairing it.

4. Much has already been spoken about the absolute

necessity of good and motorable roads for any modern nation - it being unequivocally admitted by all respondents - and hence I do not see any reason or purpose in inditing any further on this - which merely would be to restate the very obvious - moving and directly into the issues involved, thus avoiding waste of precious time and paper.

5. I, therefore, pointedly asked the learned Advocate

General Sri.C.P.Sudhakara Prasad, instructed by Sri.K.V.Manoj Kumar -learned Senior Government Pleader, appearing for the official respondents, as to the action taken to maintain the roads presently in disrepair and he submitted that over the years the latest technology and methodology have been adopted in laying new roads and for its maintenance, but concedes that, in spite of this, many of them turn decrepit for various unavoidable reasons, including the vagaries of nature and monsoons. He, however, submits that all necessary steps have been taken by the concerned Authorities to immediately cause the essential repairs, so as to make the roads safe and motoroble; and that such work will be completed not later than 31.12.2019, if not earlier depending upon the rains. As regards the roads vested with the various Local Self Government Institutions are concerned, he submits that they have also been instructed to do so within the outer limit of 31.01.2020, since more than 1,33,384 projects have been now identified for immediate repair of roads. He then adds that the Government have already recorded that all the concerned Engineers and Staff under the Local Self Government Departments and Public Works Departments will be taken to task if the work is not completed within the fixed time frames.

6. The learned Advocate General thereafter added that

all the new works being now notified and contracted are with Performance Guarantee requirements and that the officials in charge of such projects are responsible to ensure that such terms are implicitly and scrupulously imposed and complied with. He says that there is also defect liability periods in addition to the above which is imposed on the Contractors/Agencies in charge of the work and that an effective Road Maintenance Management System, as per the PWD Manual and specifications of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways (MORTH Specifications), have also been put into operation. He says that these specifications ensure computerised Road Management System so as o enable the use of limited resources available for maintenance work and controlling resources to accomplish a pre- determined level of service through planning, budgeting, scheduling, reporting and evaluating. The learned Advocate General, therefore, says that the reliefs sought for in this writ petition have already been acceded to by the Government and that no further orders may be issued.

7. From the materials available, I also notice that a few

District Collectors have initiated action against the concerned Engineers and Officials; and in obedience to the orders of this Court dated 11.10.2019, the District Collector, Ernakulam has produced a report, along with an affidavit, wherein he has proposed action against the concerned Engineers and Staff of the Corporation/PWD.

8. Even when the learned Advocate General makes the afore submissions, it is ineluctable that what is important is not words but action.

9. Unless promises and undertakings translate into tangible results, they are worthless.

10. The perceptible skepticism of citizens to repeated

promises of officials cannot be brushed aside since, it is crystal clear that, in spite of several orders issued by this Court in this writ petition - including constitution of a Road Repair Monitoring Committee - nothing has changed on the ground level.

11. Hapless citizens still spill blood and life in the craters

and pot holes in roads - the incident of the unfortunate death of Sri. R.Umesh Kumar of Kochi being only the last of such but not the last ever, unless real and effective action is taken.

12. Precious time, money and energy are being lost every

day on our roads on account of tenuous queues of vehicles caught in traffic solely because of bad roads - the consequent avoidable loss of fuel, especially detrimental to our economy, which is already reeling from the natural disasters of this and last year.

13. No amount of excuses or reasons of any kind can justify even the loss of one life or injury solely because of bad roads.

14. Past experience has shown us that the main reason for

the abject condition of roads is that repairs and maintenance are not done in time. A small pot-hole or crater that appears on an otherwise good road is left unattended, thus leading it to become bigger, then crater like, finally deracinating the entire road. Any amount of causes may be cited for this, but the primary is often the indifference and callousness exhibited by the officials in charge of the roads.

15. I am, therefore, certain that no further apathy and insocience can be tolerated and that the concerned stakeholders must be made accountable forthwith.

16. Sometimes, extraordinary situations requires extraordinary remedies! Consequentially,

(a) The Government, Public Works Department and the

Local Self Government Institutions will repair and maintain all roads immediately to make them motoroble, at least to the minimum necessary standard immediately, but not later than 31.12.2019 as far as the PWD roads are concerned and 31.01.2020 as far as the various roads under the Local Self Government

Institutions are concerned.

(b) The repair and maintenance work shall be carried on

and completed following due procedure but under the strict and continuous supervision of the concerned and competent Engineer and Staff of the respective Departments/Institutions.

(c) The primary responsibility to ensure that the repair

work is done properly and that future repairs are noticed and done without delay will be on the concerned Engineers/Staff of the respective Departments/Local Self Government Institutions and any lapse on their part in doing so would lead to necessary consequences, both under the Service Regulations and the Penal Law.

(d) It will be available to any citizen and Residents

Associations to bring the disrepair of any road, as also the formation of pot holes and craters, in future to the concerned Department/Institutions so that immediate action can be taken to repair it. The Secretaries of the concerned Local Self Government Institutions with respect to the roads under them and the Heads of the Departments concerned with the other roads will be responsible personally to respond to any such information and take necessary and urgent action.

(e) If the Secretaries of the LSGIs or the Heads of

Departments concerned encounter any issues in acting as per direction (d) above, they will be at liberty to bring it to their Controlling Authorities, who will also, thereafter, be equally responsible.

(f) In order for the citizens and Residents Associations, to

act as per the liberty given to them in direction (d) above, I direct the Government to publish the list of roads which are not under the Local Self Government Institutions with the name, designation, address, phone number, E-mail and Whats app number of the designated officer in charge in the official website of the Public Works Department. Needless to say, as regards the roads under the Local Self

Government Institutions, the citizen can approach it's secretary, in terms of the liberty granted herein.

(g) Since the learned Advocate General has already

informed me that the Road Management Maintenance System has been put in place for the roads under the PWD, I deem it also necessary that the Local Self Government Institutions constitute a team for maintenance work for day to day basis, so that the pot holes or defects in roads can be rectified immediately without waiting to let it finally destroy it. The formation of such teams/squads shall be ensured by the Secretary of the Local Self Government Institutions are concerned and if any difficulties are encountered by such Authority in doing so, he/she will be at liberty to approach the Secretary for Local Self Government Institutions appropriately, who will there upon assist in such formation through all steps that are necessary. Finally, as regards the plea of the petitioners on insistence of a minimum Five Year performance guarantee from the Contractor/Agency is concerned, this being a matter of policy to be decided upon by the Government, I cannot issue an affirmative direction, but can only commend it. I do so. I, however, also record the submissions made by the learned Advocate General that a decision has already been taken to insist on a performance guarantee for all works and that such decision is being implemented in the last couple of years. This Court certainly hopes that the directions herein, which may not be exhaustive in its nature, could operate as a minimum standard for all Authorities to act and I leave liberty to the petitioners to approach this Court for any further clarification with respect to the afore directions or further directions to be issued; in which event, the Registry is directed to list this matter for consideration appropriately. Sd/- DEVAN RAMACHANDRAN nak JUDGE APPENDIX PETITIONERS' EXHIBITS: ANNEXURE A1 THE TRUE COPY OF THE PETITION FILED BY THE PETITIONER BEFORE THE RESPONDENTS 3 TO 4 DATED 27.8.2011. EXHIBIT P1 TRUE COPY OF JUDGMENT DATED 28.8.98 IN O.P.NO.346/98 OF THIS HON'BLE COURT. EXHIBIT P2 TRUE COPY OF REPLY VIDE NO.3165/D2/98/PWD DATED 12.1.99 ISSUED BY THE 1ST RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P3 TRUE COPY OF REPLY VIDE NO.M.O.E4- 4TH RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P4 TRUE COPY OF JUDGMENT DATED 8.1.08 IN WPC.NO.31431/06

OF THIS HON'BLE COURT. EXHIBIT P5 TRUE COPY OF NOTICE SENT ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONERS ON 6.10.08 BEFORE THE 1ST RESPONDENT. EXHIBIT P6 TRUE COPY OF RELEVANT PORTION OF PWD MANUAL CONTAINS PROVISIONS FOR MAINTENANCE OF ROADS AND BRIDGES. EXHIBIT P7 TRUE COPY OF COUNTER AFFIDAVIT FILED ON BEHALF OF THE 2ND RESPONDENT IN WPC.NO.31431/06 BEFORE THIS HON'BLE COURT ON 13.9.07. EXHIBIT P8 TRUE COPY OF BROCHURE INTRODUCING LATEST MECHANICAL DEVICES FOR REPAIR AND MAINTENANCE OF ROADS. EXHIBIT P9 TRUE COPY OF LATEST NEWS REPORTS

PANNEXURE R8 BUBLISHED IN MALAYALA MANORAMA DAILY, METRO MANORAMA MATHRUBHUMI AND KERALA KAUMUDI DAILIES. EXHIBIT P10 TRUE COPY OF NEWS REPORTS PUBLISHED BY LEADING DAILIES - MALAYALA MANORAMA AND METRO MANORAMA DATED 22.5.09, INDIAN EXPRESS DATED 27.5.09, MALAYALA

MANORAMA DATED 9.6.09 AND METRO MANORAMA DATED 23.6.09. EXHIBIT P11 TRUE COPY OF REPORT SHARING EXPERIENCE OF SHRI MOHANLAL IN MATHRUBHUMI WEEKLY DATED 4.10.09. EXHIBIT P12 TRUE COPY OF ARTICLE WHICH APPEARED IN INDIAN EXPRESS DAILY DATED 12.11.09 BY JUSTICE V.R.KRISHAN IYER. EXHIBIT P13 TRUE COPY OF EDITORIAL IN MALAYALA MANORAMA DATED 17.11.09 POINT OUT THE NECESSITY FOR IMPROVING THE BASIC FACILITIES IN COCHIN. EXHIBIT P14 TRUE COPY OF NEW REPORT ABOUT THE

SLACKNESS ON THE PART OF AUTHORITIES IN IMPROVING KALOOR JUNCTION PUBLISHED IN MATHRUBHUMI ON 17.11.09.

EXHIBIT P15 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT APPEARED IN THE CITY EDITION OF THE NEW INDIA EXPRESS (EXPRESSO) DATED 10.6.2010. EXHIBIT P16 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT APPEARED IN THE CITY EDITION OF THE NEW INDIA EXPRESS (EXPRESSO) DATED 21.6.2010. EXHIBIT P17 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT APPEARED IN THE CITY EDITION OF THE MALAYALA MANORAMA (METRO MANORAMA) DATED 22.6.2010. EXHIBIT P18 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT APPEARED IN THE

CITY EDITION OF THE MALAYALA MANORAMA DATED 27.6.2010. EXHIBIT P19 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT APPEARED IN THE CITY EDITION OF THE NEW INDIA EXPRESS (SUNDAY EXPRESS) DATED 4.7.2010. EXHIBIT P20 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT APPEARED IN THE CITY EDITION OF THE MALAYALA MANORAMA (METRO MANORAMA) DATED 13.7.2010. EXHIBIT P21 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORTS CONTAINING THE PRESENT SITUATION OF ROADS AFTER 2011 MONSOON. EXHIBIT P22 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORTS WHICH

APPEARED IN METRO MANORAMA DAILY DATED 20.6.2013, 25.6.2013, 28.6.2013 AND 2.7.2013, THE PRESENT SITUATION OF ROADS AFTER THE MONSOON. (COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT IN MALAYALA MANORAMA DATED 14.8.2019 CONTAINING THE PRESENT SITUATION OF ROADS AFTER 2019 MONSOON.IN IA.1/2019)

EXHIBIT P22 A COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT IN MALAYALA MANORAMA DATED 25.8.2019 CONTAINING THE PRESENT SITUATION OF ROADS AFTER2019 MONSOON. EXHIBIT P22 B COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT IN TIMES CITY DATED 29.8.2019 CONTAINING THE PRESENT SITUATION OF ROADS AFTER 2019 MONSOON. EXHIBIT P23 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT WHICH APPEARED IN MALAYAL MANORAMA DAILY DATED 11.7.2013. EXHIBIT P24 COPY OF THE NEWS REPORT WHICH APPEARED IN MALAYALA MANORAMA DAILY DATED 17.7.2013. RESPONDENT'S/S EXHIBITS: ANNEXURE R1A TRUE COPY OF THE DETAILS REGARDING THE REQUIREMENT OF FUND UNDER THE NON PLAN WORKS FOR THE YEAR 2008-09. EXHIBIT R1 A TRUE COPY OF G.O.(MS)NO.69/13/PWD DATED 13.8.13. EXHIBIT R1 B TRUE COPY OF G.O.(MS)NO.73/13/PWD DATED 31.8.13. EXHIBIT R3 A A TRUE COPY OF A CHART SHOWING THE

ACTION PLAN PREPARED BY THE DEPARTMENT. (A CHART SHOWING THE STATUS OF THE ORDINARY REPAIRS ARRANGED AS ON 14.10.2011 (AFFIDAVIT BY R3)) EXHIBIT R3 B A CHART SHOWING AROUND 92% OF THE TOTAL MAINTENANCE AND PATCH WORKS AS ON 30.11.2011 EXHIBIT R4 A THE DETAILS OF THE ROADS UNDER THE CORPORATION OF WHICH

REPAIRING WORK ARE COMPLETED RECENTLY. (TRUE COPY OF THE WORK REPORT OF THE CORPORATION OF KOCHI. (AFFIDAVIT BY 4TH RESPONDENT.)

EXHIBIT R4 B THE DETAILS OF THE ROADS OF WHICH WORKS ARE UNDER PROGRESS. (LIST SHOWING DETAILS AND PROGRESS OF THE ROAD WORKS. (IN IA.20263/2011) EXHIBIT R4 C THE DETAILS OF THE ROADS OF WHICH WORKS PROPOSED TO BE COMPLETED BEFORE 31.3.2009 UNDER THE PLAN FUND 2008-09. EXHIBIT R5 A TRUE COPY OF THE GO(RT)NO.2282/06/ESTD DATED 23.9.06. EXHIBIT R5 B TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 16.7.08 OF THE DY.SP VIGILANCE & ANTI CORRUPTION BUREAU, ERNAKULAM, DIRECTING THE GCDA TO PRODUCE THE FILES. EXHIBIT R5 C TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 11.8.08

SENT BY THE GCDA TO THE DY. SP VIGILANCE & ANTICORRUPTION BUREAU, ERNAKULAM, FOR PERMISSION TO COMMENCE THE ROAD REPAIR WORKS. EXHIBIT R5 D REPLY DATED 25.8.08 BY SP VIGILANCE AS TO THE PROCEEDINGS IN ABEYANCE. EXHIBIT R5 E TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 25.9.08 SENT BY THE GCDA TO THE 1ST RESPONDENT/GOVT. FOR PERMISSION TO COMMENCE THE RECONSTRUCTION WORKS OF THE ROAD. EXHIBIT R5 F TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 3.10.08 SENT BY THE GCDA TO THE DY. SP VIGILANCE TO RETURN THE FILES AND FOR SANCTION TO COMMENCE THE RECONSTRUCTION WORKS OF THE ROAD. EXHIBIT R5 G TRUE COPY OF THE REPLY/NOC DATED 4.10.08 ISSUED BY THE DY. SP VIGILANCE. EXHIBIT R5 H TRUE COPY OF THE SANCTION NO.64311/IA 1ST RESPONDENT/GOVT. TO COMMENCE THE ROAD REPAIR WORKS, AFTER RE-TENDER AND TO REALIZE THE LOSS AS SPECIFIED. EXHIBIT R6 A A TABLE SHOWING THE WORKS ALREADY

CARRIED OUT AND THE WORKS TO B CARRIED OUT. (PROGRESS REPORT ON ROAD REPAIR WORKS IN NATIONAL HIGHWAYS.(AFFIDAVIT BY 6TH RESPONDENT.) (TRUE COPY OF THE GOVERNMENT ORDER NO.96/92/PW AND DATED 21.11.92. (IN COUNTER AFFIDAVIT BY ADD.R6 & R7)) EXHIBIT

R6 B TRUE COPY OF THE G.O.NO.88/99 PWD DATED 18.11.1999. EXHIBIT R9 A THE TRUE PHOTOCOPIES OF THE STATEMENTS PREPARED BY THE PROJECT DIRECTOR, PIU PALAKKAD, FOR THE PERIOD 2006-2007 TO 2008-2009 SHOWING THE DETAILS OF THE ESTIMATE SANCTIONED AND FUNDS RELEASED BY NHAI TO THE RESPECTIVE EXECUTIVE ENGINEERS OF NH DIVISIONS OF PWD.

EXHIBIT R10 A TRUE COPY OF THE STATEMENT SHOWING ALLOCATION OF FUND BY THE CENTRAL GOVERNMENT TO THE STATE GOVERNMENT. EXHIBIT R10 B TRUE COPY OF THE DETAILS OF WORKS EXECUTED ON THE STRETCH FROM AROOR TO TAMILNADU. EXHIBIT R10 C TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 23.4.2009 ADDRESSED TO THE CHIEF ENGINEER NATIONAL HIGHWAYS, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM. EXHIBIT R10 D TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 23.4.2009 ADDRESSED TO THE PROJECT DIRECTOR, NH AUTHORITY OF INDIA, TRIVANDRUM. EXHIBIT R10 E TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER DATED 11.5.2009 ADDRESSED TO THE CHAIRMAN NHAT. EXHIBIT R8 A TRUE COPY OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING DATED 29.08.2019 ANNEXURE R8 B TRUE COPY OF THE LIST OF ROADS EXHIBIT R8 C TRUE COPY OF THE ORDER UNDER SECTION 133 CRPC ISSUED TO THE SECRETARY KOCHI CORPORATION AND CHAIRMAN GCDA EXHIBIT R8 D TRUE COPY OF THE PRILIMINARY ORDERS UNDER SECTIN 133 ISSUED BY THE SUB COLLECTOR, FORT KOCHI //TRUE COPY// P.A TO JUDGE

SooperKanoon - India's Premier Online Legal Search - sooperkanoon.com